UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

------ х

JOSEPH OQUENDO,

Plaintiff,

-against-

CITY OF NEW YORK, NEW YORK CITY POLICE DEPARTMENT, former Commissioner RAYMOND W. KELLY, former Commissioner WILLIAM J. BRATTON, commissioner JAMES P. O'NEILL, legal Bureau Director JONATHAN DAVID, Former Investigator THOMAS SCOLLAN, and "JOHN DOES #1-3" and JANE DOES #1-3," said names being fictitious, but intended to designate certain unknown employees of the City of New York Police Department,

DECLARATION OF AIMEE
K. LULICH IN FURTHER
SUPPORT OF THOMAS
SCOLLAN'S MOTION TO
DISMISS THE COMPLAINT

19-CV-6352 (BMC)

Defendants.

------ x

AIMEE K. LULICH, declares pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, under penalty of perjury, that the following is true and correct:

- 1. I am an Assistant Corporation Counsel in the office of James E. Johnson, Corporation Counsel of the City of New York, attorney for defendants City of New York ("City"), New York City Police Department ("NYPD"), former NYPD Commissioners Raymond Kelly, William Bratton, and James O'Neill, former Deputy Inspector Thomas Scollan, and NYPD License Division Director Jonathan David. As such, I am familiar with the facts stated below and submit this declaration to place on the record the relevant documents in further support of defendants motion pursuant to Rule 12(b)(6) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
- 2. Attached as Exhibit "C" is the Memorandum of Law in Support of Respondents' Cross-Motion to Dismiss the Petition, which sets forth the City's arguments in the Article 78 Proceeding entitled <u>Oquendo v. City of New York, et. al.</u>, filed in New York County Supreme Court Index No. 100529 on December 12, 2014. Plaintiff refers to the City's

arguments in the Article 78 proceeding in the Complaint and the Opposition to the Motion to

Dismiss.

3. Attached as Exhibit "D" is the Transcript of oral arguments in Oquendo v.

City of New York, et. al., Index No. 100529, before the Honorable Lucy Billings, New York

County Supreme Court, on October 22, 2015. Plaintiff refers to the City's arguments and Judge

Billings' decision in the Article 78 proceeding in the Complaint, and filed this transcript on the

court docket for the instant case as a "sur-reply" to defendants City, NYPD, Kelly Bratton,

O'Neill, and David's motion to dismiss the complaint.

Dated:

New York, New York

February 14, 2020

Aimee K. Lulich Senior Counsel

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

JOSEPH OQUENDO,

Plaintiff,

-against-

CITY OF NEW YORK, NEW YORK CITY POLICE DEPARTMENT, former Commissioner RAYMOND W. KELLY, former Commissioner WILLIAM J. BRATTON, commissioner JAMES P. O'NEILL, legal Bureau Director JONATHAN DAVID, Former Investigator THOMAS SCOLLAN, and "JOHN DOES #1-3" and JANE DOES # 1-3," said names being fictitious, but intended to designate certain unknown employees of the City of New York Police Department,

Defendants.

DECLARATION OF AIMEE K. LULICH IN FURTHER SUPPORT OF THOMAS SCOLLAN'S MOTION TO DISMISS THE COMPLAINT

JAMES E. JOHNSON

Corporation Counsel of the City of New York
Attorney for Defendants City of New York, Raymond
Kelly, William Bratton, James O'Neill, Thomas
Scollan, and Jonathan David
100 Church Street Room 5-318
New York, N.Y. 10007

Of Counsel: Aimee Lulich Tel: (212) 356-2369 Matter No.: 2019-060084

Due and timely service is hereby admitted.	
New York, N.Y.	, 2019
	, Esq.
Attorney for	